[Your Name]
[Your Title]
[Your Company]
[Street Address, City, State ZIP]

May 14, 2026

[Opposing Counsel Name]
[Firm Name]
[Address]

Re: U.S. Patent No. 11589142 — Response to Assertion of Infringement

Dear Counsel,

We acknowledge receipt of your correspondence asserting infringement of U.S. Patent No. 11589142 (the "11589142 Patent"). After preliminary review, we have substantial concerns about the validity, enforceability, and scope of the asserted claims, summarized below. We reserve all rights and defenses.

1. Subject Patent — Summary

A concise summary of US Patent 11,589,142 is as follows:
Title: Mutually secure optical data network and method
Assignee: While the patent document lists "Individual" as the original and current assignee, related legal filings from the Patent Trial and Appeal Board (PTAB) identify the owner as Spada Innovations Inc. This suggests a potential transfer of ownership or a more complex assignment history.
Inventors: Joseph L. Vilella
Filing Date: July 15, 2021
Issue Date: February 21, 2023
Abstract: The patent describes a digital optical data network system designed to enhance information security within Passive Optical Networks (PONs). This is achieved by implementing virtual information…

2. Validity Concerns under 35 U.S.C. § 102 — Prior Art

We have identified prior-art references that, in our preliminary view, anticipate one or more asserted claims of the 11589142 Patent:

Analysis of Prior Art for U.S. Patent No. 11,589,142

Patent under Analysis:
• Patent Number: US 11,589,142 B2
• Title: Mutually secure optical data network and method
• Publication Date: February 21, 2023
• Assignee: SPADA Innovations Inc.
• Summary of Invention: The patent describes a method for providing secure communication in a Passive Optical Network (PON). The core of the invention involves using a primary PON interface router to create virtually separated data streams for different users. This is achieved by generating unique virtual routing tables using Virtual Routing and Forwarding (VRF) and then labeling the separated IP data packages with Multi-Protocol Label Switching (MPLS). The MPLS-labeled data is sent to a secondary router, converted back to IP, forwarded to an Optical Line Terminal (OLT), aggregated into a common feed, and then distributed to Optical Network Units (ONUs). Each ONU extracts the data intended for its specific user. This architecture aims to securely isolate traffic for different tenants or users on a shared optical network.

Prior Art Analysis…

3. Obviousness under 35 U.S.C. § 103

Independent of § 102, we believe the asserted claims are obvious in view of combinations of prior art that a person having ordinary skill in the art would have been motivated to combine:

An analysis of the obviousness of US Patent 11,589,142 under 35 U.S.C. § 103, based on the prior art cited in the patent document, is as follows.
Person Having Ordinary Skill in the Art (PHOSITA)
A person having ordinary skill in the art (PHOSITA) at the time of the invention (priority date August 2, 2012) would have had a Bachelor's degree in Electrical Engineering, Computer Science, or a related field, along with several years of experience in the design and implementation of telecommunication networks. This experience would include familiarity with network routing protocols, Layer 2 and Layer 3 VPN technologies, and optical networking architectures, specifically Passive Optical Networks (PON).
Obviousness of Independent Claims 5 and 8
Claims 5 and 8 are rendered obvious by the combination of US 2008/0212598 A1 ("'598 publication") and US 2007/0092249 A1 ("'249 publication").
Claims 5 and 8 describe a method where a PON Optical Line Terminal (OLT) receives one or more data streams that have been virtually separated for a specific end-user using Virtual Routing and Forwarding…

4. Litigation History of the Patent

Public records reflect that the 11589142 Patent has been the subject of the following litigation, which informs our view of the asserted claims and your client's enforcement posture:

• SPADA Innovations, Inc. v. AT&T Inc. — 2:24-cv-06703 · U.S. District Court for the Central District of California. · filed 2024-08-07 · early stages

• Nokia Of America Corp. v. Spada Innovations Inc. — IPR2025-01442 · USPTO Patent Trial and Appeal Board. · filed 2025-08-27 · Awaiting institution

5. Request

In light of the foregoing, we request that your client (i) provide a detailed claim chart identifying each accused product or service and mapping every limitation of each asserted claim, (ii) identify any prior art known to your client, including any references cited during prosecution or reexamination, and (iii) substantiate the basis for any damages or licensing demand. We are prepared to discuss the matter further once we have received and reviewed the foregoing.

Sincerely,

[Your Name]